Bridging the Religious Divide: Christian Perspectives  September 13, 2018
James J. Bacik

Introduction

1. What divides the Catholic Community, the Christian World and the monotheistic religions, Judaism, Christianity and Islam.

2. Resources for bridging: Catholic Common Ground Project; the Catholic Lutheran Dialogue; and the Muslim Instruction: “A Common Word.”


Part One – The Catholic Community in the United States

I. Divisions

A. History

1. Some 33 million Catholic immigrants came to the U.S. from 1820 to 1920.

2. They encountered prejudice, economic hardships and social rejection which prompted Catholics to present a united public front and to establish vibrant parishes, Catholic school systems and Catholic hospitals.

3. Beneath the public unity there was a division between Romanists represented by Bishop John Hughes (1797-1864) of New York who said no to American individualism, competitive capitalism, religious indifference, use of birth control; and the Americanists represented by Bishops John Carroll (1735-1815), John England (1786-1842) and John Ireland (1838-1918) and Isaac Hecker (1819-1898) founder of the Paulists, all who saw the United States as congenial to Catholic interests and encouraged active engagement in American society and culture. This division continues today mostly over abortion and gay marriage between culture warriors like Archbishop Chaput of Philadelphia and Francis bishops like Blase Cupich of Chicago who promotes dialogue with the contemporary world.


5. During Vatican II Catholics became aware of disagreements between conservatives (Cardinal Ottaviani) and progressives (Cardinal Suenens) on issues such as liturgical reform, attitude toward Jews, ecumenism, Mary, religious liberty.

6. Humane Vitiae 1968 birth control encyclical by Paul VI generated strong disagreement within the Catholic world that has not been resolved after 50 years.


8. Responses to Francis: he is not really the pope (traditionalists); he has led the Church to the brink of schism (Douthat); he has not done enough for women (feminists); he supports Vatican II liturgy (reform the reform advocates); he has not handled sex abuse properly (Vigano).

B. Current Divisions
1. Liberals or progressives or Vatican II Catholics energized by the spirit of Varian II as renewed by Pope Francis; resonate with the theology of Karl Rahner; support consistent ethic of life as articulated by Cardinal Bernardin; tend to support directions of Francis (Church as People of God, care for poor and marginalized, openness to LGBT community, expand ecumenical and interfaith dialogue and collaboration, support for Paris Agreement, Vatican II liturgical renewal, communion for divorced and remarried; read America and Commonweal; heroes John XXIII, Bernardin and Francis; theologians: Bernard Haring, Hans Kung, Richard McCormick, Ray Brown, John Courtney Murray, Rosemary Ruether, Charles Curran, Popularizers: Richard Rohr, Ronald Rolhiser, Joan Chittester.

2. Conservatives or neo-conservatives: like Saint J.P. II, the Great and his interpretation of Vatican II (new evangelization, pro-life, priests as spiritual fathers, engagement with modern world). Leaders (Richard Neuhaus, Michael Novak, George Weigel, Robert George, Mary Ann Glendon, Bishop Robert Barros); read First Things; Leaders are aggressively critical of Rahner and liberal Catholics that they call Catholic Lite; pro free market, pro-democratic capitalism, generally find the Republican Party a useful vehicle for their views especially on the defining issue of abortion as well as contraception and gay marriage, but Weigel and George disavowed Trump. They see the consistent ethic of life as weakening the primary effort to overturn Roe and stop abortion which is intrinsically evil. They resonate with some aspects of Hans Urs von Balthasar who aggressively attacked Rahner and claimed women’s ordination is metaphysically impossible. The followers of Balthasar are often critical of the political and economic views of the neo-conservatives. Weigel has praised Vigano as a dedicated leader and honest man.

3. Liberationists: emphasis on Catholic Social Teachings, working for justice and peace; influenced by Gustavo Gutierrez and Latin American Liberation Theology; Heroes Dorothy Day, Thomas Merton, Daniel Berrigan. Elizabeth Johnson developed liberationist themes from a feminist perspective. At a popular level Catholic liberationists work for justice and peace in various ways: public demonstrations and protests (U.S. School of the Americas, Guantanamo, torture, military involvement in Afghanistan Iraq and Syria, Israeli-Palestine dispute) working on state and city issues (adequate public housing, safe water, prison reform, racial justice) and serving on parish social justice committees dealing with local issues (neighborhood safety, housing discrimination).

4. Neo-traditionalist: small but well-financed and organized and according to some a growing group that must be taken seriously. They tend to: think Francis is not really the pope but is a heretic; prefer the Latin Tridentine Mass; support Vigano; support Cardinal Burke; oppose communion for the divorced; oppose greater openness to LGBT community and admission of gay men into priesthood. Vocal groups include Church Militant located in Ferndale, Michigan led by Michael Voris who has called for resignation of Pope Francis and believes the Church is corrupted by modernism very opposed to cultural liberalism which claims moral and intellectual superiority. Massimo Faggiolo: liberals should take seriously neo-traditionalists; they are not like classical Catholic conservatives represented by Ottaviani; they support “reform
the liturgical reform” favored by Benedict; it is an insurgency” committed to getting rid of the liberal establishment and return to the pre-Vatican II Catholic culture; holds superiority of Western culture and opposes global vision of Francis; there are similarities to political conservatism that has become more extreme and forms opposition to Francis; the movement will spread and grow but will probably not cause a schism because it is essentially opposed to Vatican II which is now established permanently.

II. Bridging – The Common Ground Project

A. Background

1. Initiative in 1992 by Cardinal Joseph Bernardin working with Msgr. Phil Murnion to deal with polarization in the Church.

B. Called to Be Catholic

1. Concern – The Church in the U.S is in a perilous situation as we approach the new millennium. Polarization, which inhibits discussion, cripples leadership, confuses young people and magnifies fears, is a major problem causing paralysis.
2. Issues – Open and honest discussion of urgent questions: the changing roles of women; religious education; Eucharistic liturgy; human sexuality, image and morale of priests; lay leadership, church and politics; capacity of Church to embrace multiculturalism; survival of Catholic institutions; dwindling financial support; manner of decision-making; responsibility of theology to authoritative church teachings; relation between Rome and American episcopacy.
3. Rediscover common ground “centered in faith in Jesus, marked by accountability to the living Catholic tradition and ruled by a renewed spirit of civility, dialogue, generosity and broad and serious consultation.”
4. We need dialogue which respects “legitimate debate, discussion and diversity” and “fresh eyes, open minds and changed hearts” while recognizing there are boundaries which circumscribe Catholic identity.
5. No single group or viewpoint in the church has a complete monopoly on the truth.
6. We should not envision ourselves as an enlightened “saving remnant” which spurns the mass of Catholics, their leaders or institutions.
7. Test all proposals for pastoral realism and theological truth.
8. Presume that those with whom we differ are acting in good faith. We should try to understand their positions and not substitute labels or blanket terms like “radical feminism” or “the Vatican.”
9. Put the best possible construction on differing positions and detect valid insights and legitimate worries.
10. Be cautious in ascribing motives and do not impugn others’ loyalty to the church.
11. Follow the lead of Gaudium et Spes by recognizing the valid achievements and real dangers of our culture.
12. In general terms healthy dialogue demands conversion – “fresh eyes and changed hearts.” The liturgy, which is crucial for such conversion, must be common ground and not a battle ground.

C. Our response
   1. Personal conversion to the Common Ground principles; befriend a Catholic who thinks differently.
   2. Try to make parishes more inclusive; promote dialogue between pro-life and social justice persons and groups; sponsor a Common Ground dialogue on controversial issues.

Part Two – U.S. Christians

I. Divides
   A. History of anti-Catholicism
      1. Catholic immigrants came to a predominately Calvinistic country and encountered suspicion and prejudice. Arthur Schlesinger called this prejudice “the deepest bias in the history of the American people.”
      2. Almost all the original colonies had restrictive anti-Catholic laws except Pennsylvania.
      3. George Washington promoted religious tolerance and Catholic participation in the revolutionary war made them more acceptable.
      4. 19th century: Mark Twain said he had been “educated to enmity toward anything that is Catholic,” educator Horace Bushnell attacked the Catholic Church as an enemy of republican values; in the 1830s the “nativist movement gained momentum leading to violence (burning Ursuline convent in 1834 in Charlestown, MA); 1850s establishment of Know Nothing political party; President Ulysses Grant supported the Blaine Amendment to make sure no public funds could be used to support “sectarian schools.”
      5. Twentieth Century – in the 1920s a renewed Ku Klux Klan was aggressively anti-Catholic, burning a cross in 1925 in front of Little Flower Church in Royal Oak, MI and assassinating Fr. James Coyle in Birmingham in 1921 for presiding at a wedding of a white woman and a Puerto Rican man; in 1922 Oregon passed a law aimed at eliminating Catholic schools (overturned by Supreme Court); 1928 presidential election Lutheran and Southern Baptist ministers warned that Catholic Democratic candidate Al Smith would take orders from the pope. World War II broke down a lot of prejudice as Catholic men fought side by side with Protestants and Catholic women worked in factories with Protestants; Paul Blanshard published in 1949 a bestselling book, American Freedom and Catholic Power claiming the Catholic Church was essentially opposed to democracy.
      6. Election of John Kennedy in 1960 was a turning point. In a talk to Houston Ministerial Association he said: “I do not speak for my Church on public matters – and the Church does not speak for me.” His election signaled the move of Catholics into the mainstream of American life.
7. Some see lingering anti-Catholicism today: for example senators questioning the
dogmatism of Catholic federal judge candidates and James Martin, S.J. says
Hollywood is fascinated by the Catholic Church but sees it as “profoundly other,”
trumpeting their differences with the Church.
8. The Catholic League headed by Bill Donohue is on constant alert for anti-Catholic
prejudice in the U.S., seeing it in the intellectual elite and religious liberty issues.
Most recently Donohue sees prejudice in the Pennsylvania Grand Jury Report saying
it puts the spotlight on the Church while ignoring other institutions, under-
estimates the role of therapists who claimed they rehabilitated offenders, and
falsely accused Cardinal Wuerl of complicity.

B. Relations with Mainline Protestants
   1. Continuing theological differences on role of pope, validity of Orders.
   2. Pastoral approach to mixed marriages.
   3. Receiving communion – Protestant churches generally more open than Catholics.
   4. Charge that in the U.S. even Catholics are Protestants.

C. Catholics and Evangelicals
   1. Issue of proselytizing by both sides.
   2. Emphasis on Word or Sacrament.
   3. Prominence of Mary.

II. Bridging
   A. Vatican II - Decree on Ecumenism
      1. High priority on restoring unity as Christ prayed for.
      2. We are already united by faith in Christ and baptism.
      3. Protestant communities are a source of truth and salvation.
      4. Importance of dialogue in search for deeper understanding of the faith and
         collaboration on spreading the kingdom.
      5. Preserving unity in essentials, freedom in diverse spiritual, theological and liturgical
         forms and charity in all things.
      6. There is proper “hierarchy of truths” (p 11).
      7. Learning from the Protestant reverence for Scriptures.

   B. Catholic – Evangelical Dialogue
      1. Pushed by neo-conservative Catholics especially the Catholic convert Richard
         Neuhaus.
         Novak, Weigel, Dulles, Protestant scholars including Mark Noll, Bill Bright, Pat
         Roberts on.
      3. These 2 communities are most “evangelistically assertive and most rapidly growing”
         but are plagued by conflict, animosity, and suspicion.
      4. They find common cause in safeguarding religious freedom which is under attack
         and in securing legal protection of the unborn and in reducing the incidence of
         abortion. They also are joined in supporting school choice, moral education, efforts
against pornography, greater tolerance, a vibrant market economy, family life, foreign policy that defends democracy and human rights.

5. They oppose proselytizing that amounts to “sheep stealing” and comparing our strengths against the weaknesses of others.

6. They stress cooperation in the great mission of spreading the Christian faith.

7. Criticisms: Catholics in this dialogue have played down Catholic Social Teaching, care for the marginalized (refugees, immigrants, the poor); no critique of free market economy.

C. Catholic Lutheran 1999 Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification (JDDJ)

1. Methodology: The Declaration recognizes that past condemnations are still in effect dividing the churches: it develops current consensus statements; it examines differences of emphasis and explication and finds that they do not undercut the consensus and need no longer divide the churches.

2. Content: The major consensus statement: “Together we confess: By grace alone in faith in Christ’s saving work and not because of any merit on our part, we are accepted by God and receive the Holy Spirit who renews our hearts while equipping and calling us to good works” (n15). We are justified through Christ by faith which is a free gift and cannot be merited in any way. This leads us to “renewal of life” which God will bring to completion in eternal life. The doctrine of justification is “an indispensable criterion” which orients “all the teaching and practice of our churches to Christ.” When Lutherans emphasis the unique role of this doctrine, they do not deny its interrelation to other important doctrines. When Catholics stress other doctrines they do not deny “the special function of the message of justification.”

3. Summary: Catholics and Lutherans share a common teaching on justification, the remaining differences in language, theological elaboration and emphasis are acceptable and do not destroy the consensus; the teaching of Lutherans today do not fall under the condemnations of Trent nor do the condemnations in Lutheran Confessions apply to current Catholic teaching; the Declaration should promote further dialogue on disputed questions such as ministry and sacraments.

4. Negative Responses: Some Lutherans, for example members of the Confessional Evangelical Lutheran Council (CELC), attacked the JDDJ as a fraud and betrayal of the Gospel by Lutherans because it does not recognize the condemnations of Trent. Critics cite statements in the Catholic Catechism (for example para 2015 and 2022) and the official Vatican response to JDDJ to show Catholics still think salvation comes from grace plus human cooperation.

5. Positive Responses: In 2006 the World Methodist Council affirmed fundamental agreement with JDDJ; in 2016 the Anglican Consultative Council affirmed the substance of JDDJ; the World Communion of Reformed Churches has associated itself with JDDJ (July 2017).

D. Popular Responses

1. Importance of ecumenical messages and close friendships.
2. Living Room Dialogues.
3. Clergy dialogue and cooperation.

Part Three – Monotheistic Religions in U.S.
I. **American Grace (research done in 2006)**

A. **Background**
   1. Americans are religiously devout judged by weekly attendance at religious services, around 38%, higher than Iran, Italy, Canada, Britain, China, Germany, France, Russia.
   2. We are religiously diverse.
   3. We are religiously tolerant.

B. **History**
   1. In the 1950s Americans reported religion was a huge impact on them and our country.
   2. In the 1960s the sexual revolution and other changes caused a “shock” that diminished the influence of religion.
   3. This produced an “aftershock” represented by the general growth of Evangelical Christians from the 1970s through the mid-1990s while other groups were shrinking.
   4. Growth of “Nones” beginning in the late 1980s caused in part by the mixing of religion and politics especially the popular identification of religiosity and conservative politics. This has led to a polarized religious environment.
   5. Frequency of grace before meals: 44% daily, 46% occasionally or never. This is an indicator of political allegiance which is a divisive factor.

C. **Religious Intolerance**
   1. Saved: 98% of Mormons, 93% of Catholics and 83% of evangelicals say members of other religions are good people and can go to heaven. A majority say non-Christians can go to heaven including 54% of every church. On the warmth scale Mormons, Muslims and Buddhists are rated lowest.
   2. Knowing personally a member of another religious group increased positive feeling about that group but also about others generally.
   3. Fluidity: Almost 40% of Americans are of a different religion today than the one they were raised in. This also increases tolerance. Around half of all marriages today cross religious lines.

D. **Value of religious affiliation**
   1. They report higher degrees of happiness.
   2. They are better citizens in terms of contributing to charitable causes, volunteering, and helping neighbors.
   3. This is related to having friends in their religious congregation and not a particular belief. This suggests the importance of parishes forming groups to work for justice and to help those in need.

E. **Criticisms of American Grace**
   1. Little sense of the passionate divide within Catholics.
   2. Failure to emphasize the prophetic role of religion that challenges the unjust systems.
   3. Too optimistic about the unifying factors.
   4. Not enough discussion of Islamophobia.
5. Most of the “Nones” still believe in God and their numbers are growing since the research in the book. In a one-year period one-third of “Nones” joined a religion.

6. What role does class and education play in religious devotion and tolerance. Upper class blacks are more likely to attend church than poor blacks.

7. Religiosity is defined too narrowly in terms of church attendance and not enough on social justice.

8. Young persons: more likely to be among the “Nones”; more open to LGBT community and to gay marriages; more upset by identification of religion and politics that has been growing since the 1970s; more likely to be pro-life.

II. Pew Research

A. Background: A 2017 study based on a “feeling thermometer” (0 to 100) measures how Americans feel about various religions.

B. Findings

1. Almost all religious groups were rated more favorably in 2016 than 2014 across all groups young and old, men and women, Democrats and Republicans.

2. Mean thermometer ratings showing favorability: Jews 67; Catholics 66; Mainline Protestants 65; Evangelical Christians 61; Buddhists 60; Hindus 58; Mormons 54; Atheists 50; Muslims 48.

3. Christians tend to have warm feelings for other Christians but less so for Muslims and atheists. An exception, black Americans give Muslims a high 62 rating.

4. Education: Americans with college education give warmer ratings to most groups than less educated.

5. Personal relationships – knowing someone of another religion increases positive feelings about their religion. About 86% of Americans know a Catholic, 45% Muslim, 22% know a Hindu.

6. Partisanship – Democrats give Muslims a 56 rating; Republicans rate Muslims at 39 degrees (up from 33 in 2014).

III. Anti-Semitism

A. History

1. Before 1881 Jews were a small percentage of the population. They experienced less discrimination in the U.S. than in Europe though there were some restrictions and leaders like General Ulysses Grant who expelled Jews from areas under his control during the Civil War (Lincoln quickly reversed this order).

2. Between 1881-1920 some 3 million Jews from Eastern Europe and Russia came to the U.S. to escape pogroms but encountered discrimination here and a resurgence of anti-Semitism. In the 1920s Jews were berated by the Klan, Henry Ford, and Father Charles Coughlin (1891-1979), a Canadian born, Detroit priest, pastor of Little Flower Shrine with a huge 1930s weekly radio audience (as many as 30 million). He blamed the depression on Jewish bankers as well as the Communist take-over in Russia. President Roosevelt silenced him to some
1. In 1942, but it was only in 1942 that Bishop Edward Mooney completely stopped his public ministry.

3. Lynching: Leo Frank, a Jewish factory supervisor was convicted on May 24, 1913 of the rape and murder of a 13 year-old girl who worked in the factory. Later Governor Slaton commuted Frank’s sentence to life imprisonment. On August 16, 1915, a mob kidnapped Frank from prison and lynched him in Marietta, GA, home of Mary Phagan. The case made national news and went to the Supreme Court, sparked the revival of the Ku Klux Klan and the birth of the Anti-Defamation League (ADL), most historians today think Frank was innocent.

4. In 1924 Congress passed the Johnson Reed Act, severely restricting immigrants from Eastern Europe, especially affecting Jews and Catholics.

5. Major universities restricted the number of Jewish students (10% of total student enrollment) policies that existed into the 1950s.

B. Current Situation
1. Increase in attacks on Jews since 2016. Some claim a 37% increase in anti-Semitism incidents in 2017. While nationalist blogs blame Jews for fake news targeting President Trump.


3. Jews have highest favorability rating of any U.S. religious group (Pew Study).

4. Evangelicals are strong in defending Israel.

C. Vatican II Declaration on Non–Christian Religions
1. All Christians are sons of Abraham (n4).

2. Christ has reconciled Jews and Christians making them one in himself.

3. The Apostles were Jews.

4. Paul teaches us that the Jews remain “very dear to God.”

5. The Church encourages better understanding of our Jewish brothers and sisters through study and friendly dialogue.

6. Even though the Jewish authorities pressed for the death of Jesus, “neither all Jews indiscriminately at that time, nor Jews today, can be charged with the crimes committed during his passion.” (n4)

7. The Church deplores all hatred, persecutions and displays of anti-Semitism.

D. Popular Level
1. Befriend Jewish persons.

2. Avoid all anti-Semitic rhetoric.

3. Be judicious in doing Seder services.

4. See the Jewish religion not simply as a pre-cursor but as a legitimate, important, viable religion in today’s world.

5. Hear the Hebrew Scriptures not only as foreshadowing Christ but as having religious significance on their own.

6. Righteous Gentiles: story of Master Sgt. Roddie Edmonds captured by Germans in the Battle of the Bulge, saved American Jewish POWs by lining up all Gentile POWs and saying: “We are all Jews.”
VI. Christian Muslim Relations

A. History
   1. Mohammed (570-632) united all Arabian tribes as believers in Allah, had a positive view of People of the Book.
   2. Islamic expansion: conquered Damascus in 635, Jerusalem in 638, and later Egypt and parts of North Africa and Spain which Islam controlled from the 8th century until 1492.
   3. Crusades: First one 1096 to 1099 took Jerusalem and others ending in 1291 were less successful.
   4. Muslim achievements: From the 7th thru the 16th centuries Islam was a dominant world civilization renowned for medicine, architecture, arts and philosophy.
   5. Humiliated by Western colonialism and the fall of the Ottoman Empire, completed after WWI.

B. Current Situation
   1. Low favorability of Muslims in U.S.
   2. Growing hate crimes directed at Muslims.
   3. Arson at the Islamic Center of Greater Toledo on September 30, 2012 followed by strong support by Christians and Jews.

C. Vatican II
   1. Positive view of Muslims who worship one God and strive to do God’s will.
   2. Venerate Jesus as a great prophet and honor Mary.
   3. Insist on living a moral life based on love of neighbor.
   4. Await the final judgment and the reward for a good life.

D. “A Common Word Between Us and You” (Ramadan 2007)
   1. Christians and Muslims together are over ½ the world’s population so religious peace is crucial for world peace.
   2. The letter has received a positive response from most Christ groups.
   3. Common ground – Love of God and love of neighbor are essential core elements in both traditions and form a firm foundation for dialogue and collaboration on behalf of justice and peace in the world.
   4. Constructive Christian-Muslim dialogues can focus on various similarities: for instance, mutual respect for Jesus and Muhammed; the wisdom found in the Bible and the Quran; the relationship between Lent and Ramadan; the importance of daily prayer and the role of pilgrimages.
   5. The letter wisely focuses on a teaching especially familiar to Christians, the commandment of Jesus to love God wholeheartedly and our neighbor as ourselves. The burden of the letter, then, is to demonstrate to Christian readers that this dual command is also central to Islam.
   6. In Islam, love of God is “not a mere fleeting, partial emotion;” it is “an injunction requiring all-embracing, constant and active love of God” inspired by frequent repetition of the formula, “there is no god but God.”
7. For Muslims, love of neighbor is an essential and integral part of faith in God,” because “in Islam without love of the neighbor there is no true faith in God and no righteousness.” The letter points to a similar teaching in the Bible, recalling the teaching of Jesus that the second great commandment is like the first: You shall love your neighbor as yourself (MT 22:38-40)—a command found also in the Hebrew Scriptures (Lev 19:17-18).

8. The Muslim authors of the letter want all Christians to know “that we are not against them and that Islam is not against them” – as long as they do not wage war or oppress Muslims.

9. Let love of God and neighbor be “the basis of all future interfaith dialogue.”

10. To those who “relish conflict and destruction” in itself or as a tactical weapon, “we say that our very eternal souls are at stake if we fail to sincerely make every effort to make peace and come together in harmony.”

E. Abraham

1. The Father in Faith for all three monotheistic religions.

2. For Jews, the story of Abraham begins the story of salvation through his offspring.

3. Christians accept the Hebrew Scriptures and praise Abraham as our Spiritual Father in faith.

4. Muslims see themselves descending from Abraham’s son Ishmael who together with his father went to Arabia and rebuilt the mosque of the Kaaba in Mecca.
Accessing other Father James Bacik lectures and reflections is easy:
You can access previous lectures at: www.frjimbacik.org and you can access WGTE’s video library of Father Bacik lectures at the Franciscan Center at:
www.knowledgestream.org
If you would like to receive Father James Bacik’s Weekly Meditations and Monthly Reflection, send your request to jamesjbacik@gmail.com

______________________________

Father Bacik’s 2018 Lecture Dates at the Franciscan Center

Thursday, October 11: Bridging the Political Divide: Christian Perspectives

Drawing on Catholic social teaching and the example of the late Senator John McCain, Fr. Jim Bacik will offer suggestions for bridging the partisan divide between conservatives and liberals, Republicans and Democrats, and Trump loyalists and Trump critics.

Thursday, November 8: Bridging the Economic Divide: Christian Perspectives

Thursday, December 13: Advent Reflection

Thursdays, 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m. in the Franciscan Center
$10 Pre-registered; $15 at the door
Register online at www.sylvaniafranciscanvillage.org, or pre-register by calling Laurie Bertke at 419-824-3515 or emailing lbertke@sistersosf.org